

KINGS LAW REPORTS

(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)

(2009) KLR VOL 6 PART 268 pp. 1463 - 1608

JUNE 2009

Dedicated to the King of kings

O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor

Nnabuike S. Orji Esq. Managing Editor

INDEX OF CASES REPORTED

1. Ani v. State p.1463
2. Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483
3. Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525
4. Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

COURT OF APPEAL CASE

Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA

ii INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2009) 6 KLR

ACTIONS - Pre-action notice - Right to - Applicability of waiver - Right to be served with such notice - Is not within the category of rights which cannot be waived - Though it affects jurisdiction of court (H1) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

APPEALS - Concurrent findings of fact - Interference with - Propriety - Where lower courts found that no case was made against 3 of the defendants - As perversity has not been shown in the finding - It will not be interfered with (H6) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

APPEALS - Issue - That is irrelevant to decision appealed against - Competence of - It is incompetent and liable to be struck out - As it is akin to an academic question (H5) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

APPEALS - Respondent's notice - Resort to - Propriety - It is validly raised as applicant is not asking for reversal - Of findings of fact made against him (H8) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

CONTRACTS - Construction - Redundant machinery - As basis for damages - It requires evidence of facts such as inquiries for their hire - Depreciation & maintenance - Appellant failed to prove any of these facts (H3) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

COURTS - Appeal courts - Omissions by trial court - Power to correct - Court of Appeal is in as good a position as trial court to do or refrain from doing - What trial court has erroneously done or refrained from (H1) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

COURTS - Findings of fact - Misdirection - Applicability - Court of Appeal misdirected itself when it held that PW1 recognized appellants' voices - Evidence before the High Court was that he recognized them with light from bush lantern (H3) Ani v. State p.1463

COURTS - Resolution of issues - After a finding of lack of jurisdiction - Propriety - Any court below the Supreme Court - Is in order to take the merits - After such finding - In case the finding is declared wrong on appeal (H6) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Alibi - Rebuttal - Duty of prosecution - Once alibi is raised - Burden is on prosecution to investigate and rebut such evidence - Neither of which was done in this case (H4) Ani v. State p.1463

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Identity of accused - Recognition - Need for early mention - Though PW1 explained why he did not mention names to villagers - But DW1 insists that he also failed to mention them when he first reported to police (H1) Ani v. State p.1463

CUSTOMARY LAW - Customary tenancy - Grant of forfeiture - Propriety - In the absence of specific finding by trial court on ishakole - And as such on issue of customary tenancy - There can be no grant of forfeiture (H7) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

DAMAGES - Award - Entitlement - Sufficiency of proof - Evidence of PW4 established that appellant can no longer use the land - For industrial purposes - This is sufficient proof that appellant suffered damages (H4) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

DAMAGES - Special damages - Recovery - Requirements - They must be specifically pleaded and strictly proved by plaintiff - It is not a matter of hypothetical exercise (H2) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

DAMAGES - Special damages - Trespass - Proof - Court of Appeal was wrong to have held that there was no evidence in proof of special damages - On alleged ground that there was no trespass - There is evidence of both trespass and special damages (H5) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

ESTOPPEL - Issue estoppel - Applicability - Issue of title having been earlier resolved - Between same parties and privies - Trial judge properly applied the principle - As rightly upheld by Court of Appeal (H2) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

ESTOPPEL - Issue estoppel - Effect - It is an impediment which bars

iv **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2009) 6 KLR**

a person from re-litigating an issue - Which has been isolated and raised in a particular proceeding - In which it was finally determined (H1) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

EVIDENCE - Evaluation - Reevaluation on appeal - Correctness -

B For Court of Appeal to hold that complainant gave names of appellants - At the first report - Is not borne out from the record (H2) Ani v. State p.1463

C EVIDENCE - Proof - Document pleaded but not tendered - Effect - Once plaintiff puts sufficient evidence in support of his claim - It is not the law that all documents pleaded - Must be tendered in evidence (H4) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

D JUDICIAL PRECEDENTS - Mandatory statutory provisions - Applicability of waiver - Principles - It appears Supreme Court put the position too wide in Menakaya case - In view of the court's later decision in the case of Mobil (H3) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

E JURISDICTION - Matters affecting - Categorization - For purpose of waiver - They should be categorized into those affecting the public and those affecting the parties - The former cannot in law be waived - But the latter can be waived (H2) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561

JUSTICE - Miscarriage - Improper evaluation of evidence - Need to arrest - It will perpetuate injustice in our judicial processes - If appellate court does not interfere therein (H7) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

H PLEADINGS - Averments - General traverse - Construction - The practice is to give it effect along with the whole tenor of other averments - It is not the practice to consider each paragraph of statement of defence in isolation (H6) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

PLEADINGS - Statement of defence - General traverse - Effect - It

INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2009) 6 KLR v

has the same effect as specific denial - That is to put plaintiff to proof of the allegation in that paragraph (H5) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483

PLEADINGS - Statement of defence - General traverse - Propriety - In respect of essential and material allegations in statement of claim - General traverse is not enough to controvert them - They must be specifically denied (H3) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525 B

PLEADINGS - Statement of defence - General traverse - Purpose of - It serves to salvage such a situation - Where a pleader may inadvertently fail to deny a fact - Thereby admitting what he did not intend to (H4) Arisons Ltd v. Military Governor Ogun State p. 1483 C

STATUTES - Pre-action notice - NNPC Act, s. 12(2) - Applicability of waiver - The section could be waived in law - And respondent has waived it in this case (H3) Feed & Food Farms Ltd v. NNPC p. 1561 D

COURT OF APPEAL

ACCIDENTS - Proof - Corroboration - Position of lorry - Respondents adduced no evidence - To show that it obstructed the road - Whereas Exhibit S corroborates appellants' evidence - That it was parked off the road (H3) Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA E

DAMAGES - Quantum - Award in excess of claim - Propriety - It is patently wrong in law - As it amounts to making a different case - From what is placed before the court by parties (H5) Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA F

EVIDENCE - Evaluation - Findings - Setting aside of - Though an appellate court will not ordinarily interfere with a finding - It would set it aside - Where it is not borne out of proper evaluation of evidence (H4) Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA G

EVIDENCE - Proof - Sufficiency of witnesses - Though respondents were not bound to call a host of witnesses - To prove their claim - In view of the burden on them - It would have been prudent to do so H

vi **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2009) 6 KLR CA**
(H2) Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA

TORTS - Negligence - Definition - It is the omission to do something
- Which a reasonable man would do - Or doing something which a
reasonable man would not do (H1) Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA

B

C

INDEX OF STATUTES

Evidence Act, s. 149 (d) Bamgbegbin v. Oriare p. 1525

D Evidence Act, s. 137 Onwughalu v. Uche p. 1585 CA

E

F

G

H